

Summary of Meeting
Tolko Industries Ltd. Manitoba Woodlands CSA Public Advisory Committee
January 21-22, 2004
Bignell Room, Kikiwak Inn
Opaskwayak Cree Nation, Manitoba

Description

The meeting's primary purpose was to revisit draft values, objectives, indicators and targets previously drafted for Element 3.2 of CSA Sustainable Forest Management Standard Z809-02, and to review Parking Lot items. A range of other items was also on the agenda.

Attendance of committee members from the public at large and/or representing a range of organizations, together with Tolko staff and consultants, is recorded on Attachments 1 and 2. Sheldon McLeod of SLMcLeod Consulting facilitated the meeting. Avery Ascher of ASCHERWORDSMITH recorded the proceedings.

Introductions and Meeting Agenda

Following a roundtable introduction, McLeod reviewed the agenda for the January 21-22 meeting (Attachment 3). It was requested that two additional items be brought forward for discussion: 1. using changes in forest composition as an indicator of changed soil extent; 2. ideally no net gain in road kilometres (this should have been noted as an action item for D. Soprovich arising from the October 21-22 meeting).

Presentation on the 2004 Annual Plan

It was noted that this presentation had been made previously at the November 12 Tolko FRAC meeting.

Highrock Forest Section

Andrew Forward, Supervisor/Planner for the Highrock Forest Section, provided an overview of Tolko's present and planned activities in this area which encompasses 6 Forest Management Units (FMU). Forward pointed out various areas and features on a map including reserves, TLE selections, highways, resource roads, proposed roads, cutblocks identified for 2004-2006, and contingency blocks. Forward indicated the AAC that had been determined by the province, and how much volume was allocated to quota holders, for FMU 60. Tolko has not completed its Caribou Strategy for the Wedge Lake area, and so is

presently not allowed to harvest there. The Caribou Strategy is addressing issues related to movement of animals between summer and wintering areas.

With respect to FMU 61, the Buzz Lake area is the only one proposed for harvest. Tolko does not have a contractor operating regularly in this area. In FMU 63, the Jungle Lake area, Tolko has identified 3 areas it proposes to operate in next year. With respect to FMU 65, discussion is ongoing with the community of Snow Lake regarding Tolko's proposed plans.

Tolko is looking at 5 operations in FMU 62 this year. The company employs local contractors and works with long-established quota holders in this area. A caribou management plan has been produced for the Naosap Lake area and signed off by the provincial government.

Nelson River Forest Section

Don Aikman, Planner for the Nelson River Forest Section, provided an overview of Tolko's present and planned activities in this area. With respect to FMU 66, operations will remain economical as long as the Lynn Lake railway line remains operating. Tolko works with some First Nations contractors in this area, and is open to discussing additional contracting opportunities.

Tolko had a meeting with Manitoba Hydro and Nisichiwayasihk Cree Nation with respect to Hydro's planned transmission line in the Birchtree Mine area. Aikman reviewed how the quota holder system works on the FMLA, and where various quota holders and different contractors will be operating in the Thompson/Wabowden areas. He noted that difficulties in obtaining DFO approval for a water crossing on Landing road have required the company to opt for winter logging in that area.

Tolko has applied to cut 150% of the AAC in FMU 84. It was noted that provincial regulations allow some flexibility in occasionally exceeding the AAC in one area in one year, so long as the volume taken is balanced out within 5 years.

Saskatchewan River Forest Section

Mike Paddock Supervisor/ Planner, Saskatchewan River Forest Section, noted Tolko has four operators in FMU 56 and reviewed where they will be operating. Some chipperwood for the pulp mill will be produced in the bush.

Present and future contractor operations in FMU 55 (Cormorant operating area) and 53 were reviewed. In FMU 53, Tolko will be cutting based on ecosystem-based management that mimics natural disturbance. Manitoba Conservation has approved this plan. This will result in larger cuts, starting at the backs of blocks and closing access as operations go along.

The large Area of Special Interest that has been set aside by the provincial government, and its potential impact on Tolko's operations and its contractors in FMUs 51 and 53, was discussed. The importance of leave areas (e.g. snags, patches) within large cuts to provide wildlife habitat was raised.

A Q&A period followed the presentation.

Presentation on Forest Renewal

Paul Chapman, Silviculture Forester, outlined areas Tolko is responsible for renewing following harvest, and which areas the province is responsible for. Six million seedlings are to be planted in 2004; the number is down about 2 million due to the effects of the 2003 sawmill strike on renewal planning and logistics. The shortfall will be addressed during next year's planting program. The areas to be reforested this year were outlined. All seedlings are container-grown in nurseries. Chapman noted there is a priority to get planting done in the Egg Lake area so Tolko can meet its commitment to closing that access road. A Q&A period followed.

Presentation on Brett McGurk Master's Thesis

John Sinclair of the University of Manitoba's Natural Resources Institute gave a synopsis of research done by graduate student Brett McGurk into forest resources advisory committees (Attachment 4). He noted that McGurk's research forms part of a bigger project looking at public involvement in sustainable forest management planning, and that a Canadian Forest Service questionnaire relating to this issue had been sent out to members of all forest company FRACs in Manitoba. A Q&A session followed.

Brief Overview of CSA and Progress to Date

Sheldon McLeod reviewed progress to date in drafting Tolko's Sustainable Forest Management Plan, and commented on the need for the committee to review the whole plan once it's complete. He said at least one more session would be needed for the committee to complete its tasks.

Review of Minutes from October 2003 CSA Meeting

The following points were raised respecting the minutes of the October 21-22, 2003 public advisory committee meeting:

1. The list of cumulative parking lot items should include: “Ideally no net gain in road kilometres”.
2. During discussion of Element 3.1 at a previous meeting, a point relating to soil extent was left unresolved. The committee will need to revisit this point.
3. Re paragraph 3 of item 5 on page 4 of the minutes, which relates to Element 1.4:

The following additional Value was suggested: Large areas of forest minimally impacted by humans. An Objective, Indicator and Target relating to this value were also suggested.

It was noted that it would have been useful to identify the Objective, Indicator and Target referred to.

Action Item: A. Ascher to review notes taken during the October 21-22 meeting to find this information.

Follow-up results: The information relating to the Value *Large areas of forest minimally impacted by humans* is as follows:

Objective: Develop a pre-harvest plan based on scientific principles.

Indicator: Existence of a pre-harvest plan.

Target: Plan completed within 2 years.

With these changes, the minutes were accepted as presented.

Sheldon McLeod asked for committee members for a quick update on their progress on Action Items identified in the October 21-22 minutes.

Item 1: Doug Hunt to review available information relating to the concept of “historical natural range” and ways to define it to make the target meaningful, and report on this at the next PAC meeting. Under review; will likely report by next committee meeting.

Item 2: Doug Hunt is to begin researching how fire disturbance patterns can be determined. At the next meeting of the PAC, he is to report when he expects to have more complete information on this subject. Working on this; doing some GIS analysis; expects to have this before the first complete draft of the SFM plan.

Item 3: Before the next CSA meeting Dan Soprovich and Troy Werstroh to look into the relative usefulness of trapping records (as they relate to fur prices) as a measure of ecosystem abundance and health. They are to look into this from the scientific and government perspective, and report back at the next PAC meeting.

Soprovich has put together a report and discussed it with Werstroh. Werstroh has discussed with Manitoba Conservation staff, and learned that many years of raw data have been lost. Soprovich to make copies of

his report available to committee members for discussion during the second day of January 21-22 meeting.

Item 4: Before the next CSA meeting Ron Spence, Glenn McIvor, Ed Johanson and Bob Huck to look into this from the on-the-land/trapping industry perspective, and report back at the next PAC meeting.

Committee members did not discuss this as a group, but would share their thoughts at the January 21-22 meeting.

Item 5: Committee members to decide where (with which criterion) the following points will be addressed:

- *Specific species linked in importance to specific communities (possibly 6.2)*
- *Community consultation (possibly 6.2)*

Sheldon McLeod noted that this was something for all committee members to think about; it does not necessarily have to be on today's agenda (i.e. January 21) agenda.

Item 6: Doug Hunt to check with Tolko management regarding the company's willingness to collaborate with other groups in approaching the government on matters relating to ASIs. Hunt has information on this that he will present to the group following Item 7 on the January 21-22 agenda.

Item 7: Dan Soprovich to check into a particular source of funding that might be receptive to funding such an environmental/industry collaborative approach. He is also to put together an overview of possible collaborative partners on the environmental side. This item also to be discussed following Item 7 on the January 21-22 agenda.

Item 8: Synopses are to be prepared by the following committee members. Such synopses should identify the issue as defined by this advisory committee and should propose positions, which would be reflective of all interests of members of the advisory committee.

1. Stumpage revenues staying in the north – no update at this time.
2. Policy underpinnings of AAC – D. Soprovich has put together information in a handout.
3. Large tracts of forest minimally disturbed by humans - D. Soprovich has put together information in a handout.
4. Government maintaining some selected Tolko roads – J. Head has some information.
5. Forest conversion – no update at this time.
6. Selling power into the grid – D. Hunt has some information.
7. Seed zones – federal and provincial – P. Chapman reported that Tolko is required to use provincial regulations with respect to seed movement for all species except jack pine. The provincial government has approved Tolko using federally-developed

guidelines for jack pine seed movement. There is no need for further follow-up on this item.

8. PSP in areas to be herbicided – D. Hunt had assigned this Tolko's inventory forester, Fiona Donald, for follow-up. He will check with Donald with respect to an update.

Presentation on Cumulative Environmental Assessment in Canada

John Sinclair presented a brief outline of the history, purposes of, and factors triggering the cumulative environmental assessment (CEA) process in Canada. A handout outlining the five steps followed in CEAs (Attachment 5) was distributed to committee members. Sinclair noted that the most important decisions relate to scoping, which also tends to be the most controversial step.

Sheldon McLeod noted that there were a couple of things the public advisory committee should keep in mind related to environmental assessment:

1. That through development of the SFM plan, the group has been assisting in cumulative effects assessment though identifying valued ecosystem components;
2. That there have been proposed amendments to the provincial Environmental Act, and that if the group wished it could draw the Minister's attention to recommendations it thinks are important.

Revisit Criterion 3 – Conservation of Soil and Water Resources

- **Element 3.2 – Water Quality and Quantity**

Sheldon McLeod noted that the committee had decided to revisit Criterion 3 as it had been the first one the group had discussed, before a standard way of documenting criteria had evolved.

The committee discussed, revised and accepted Element 3.2, as detailed on Attachment 6.

The following points generated much discussion:

- There needs to be some recognition that Tolko cannot be responsible for things it has no control over. There is a span of control that the SFM plan implies.

- The notion of being able to measure the health of a watershed is not at the point where we can write it down and measure it. Consideration could be given to tracking the evolution of the science of monitoring, and when some feasible means of monitoring develops, to applying it to Tolko's forest operations.

McLeod raised the point of soil extent for the group to follow up on (this had been added to the agenda). The committee had previously discussed using tree species composition as an indicator of changed soil extent. Following discussion, the committee decided to drop this point and it will not form part of Element 3.1.

Review of Parking Lot Items

Sheldon McLeod noted there a couple of possible outcomes respecting the parking lot items: they could be woven back into the SFM plan, or they could be raised with the provincial government.

Note: The following item is not formally documented as a parking lot item, but rather relates to Action Item #3 identified from the October 21-22, 2003 minutes. It was, however, discussed at this time.

1. *Furbearing species as indicators of forest health* – Dan Soprovich distributed the handout he had prepared (Attachment 7), and reviewed the key points. Troy Werstroh reported on his investigations into the availability of provincial fur trapping records. Discussion followed on the possibility of Tolko sponsoring some study of the effects of harvesting on furbearing animals on its license area.

Action item: Doug Hunt, Dan Soprovich and Bob Huck to explore this suggestion, and provide an update at the next committee meeting.

Note: The following item also is not formally documented as a parking lot item, but rather relates to Action Items #7 and #8 identified from the October 21-22, 2003 minutes. It was, however, discussed at this time.

2. *Collaborative efforts in approaching government about progress to date on ASIs* - Doug Hunt reported that Tolko is willing to collaborate, but not to lead, in this area. Tolko does not presently have the tools (e.g. inventory data) to evaluate the potential impacts of ASIs on its license area. Dan Soprovich noted that a group called the Boreal Forest Conservation Framework has been

formed with the aim of protecting large areas of boreal forest. Dan also looked into funding for multi-stakeholder work on ASIs on Tolko's FLMA; one source has indicated an interest but no decision would be made until the fall.

Action item: Doug Hunt to contact the provincial department of Parks and Protected Areas to have a representative make a presentation at the next CSA public advisory committee meeting on the current status of ASIs.

After this presentation, the committee will make a decision respecting moving ahead with some kind of collaborative action.

3. *Ideally no net gain in road kilometres* – Dan Soprovich distributed the handout he had prepared (Attachment 8), and reviewed key points. He noted this is a draft, and would welcome input from other committee members.
4. *Policy underpinnings of AAC* – Dan Soprovich distributed the handout he had prepared (Attachment 9), and reviewed key points. Following discussion it was decided to do the following:

Action item: Dan Soprovich's report to be faxed to Greg Carlson (Manitoba Government). Troy Werstroh to approach Carlson about responding to Doug Hunt about the report. This item is to be brought back to the next committee meeting.

5. *Government maintaining some selected Tolko roads* – Judy Head noted that the province makes decisions respecting closure of logging roads on a case-by-case basis. Factors include community concerns and wishes, the issue of liability for Tolko and unwillingness by the province to assume responsibility for such roads once they're not longer needed by Tolko. The need for some continuity of process from planning through to final disposition was discussed.

Action item: Sheldon McLeod and Doug Hunt to review this, and come back to the committee's next meeting with some suggestions as how or through whom this issue might be raised with the government.

6. *Selling power into the grid* – Doug Hunt spoke with Tolko managers on the kraft papers side; discussions have been ongoing with Hydro but there would be no economic return for Tolko. Hunt also contacted Spruce Products; this company has had similar discussions with Manitoba Hydro.

Action item: Doug Hunt to review this again with kraft papers to determine their interest in/the feasibility of pursuing this, and will report back at the committee's next meeting.

7. *PSPs in areas to be herbicided* – Fiona Donald, Inventory Forester, reported that Tolko collects information from regular and enhanced permanent sample plots (PSPs). Tolko could consider establishing enhanced PSPs in certain areas before herbiciding takes place; this would be a long-term study. It was noted extensive research has been done on the effects of herbiciding on plant and animal populations.

Action item: Paul Chapman to bring such research findings to the next committee meeting. Doug Hunt also to distribute an executive summary of a herbiciding study Tolko commissioned several years ago with the minutes of the January 21-22 meeting, and to bring the actual study to the next committee meeting.

Donald described how she would implement an enhanced PSP herbiciding study. The approach taken would be to sample one of 7 soil types. Three sites representing this soil type would be chosen, with three plots established on each of these three sites. This work would be undertaken in 2004. The committee discussed that such a study would be incorporated into the SFM plan at some later time. No specific action item was put forward.

8. *Large tracts of forest minimally disturbed by humans* – Dan Soprovich distributed the handout he had prepared (Attachment 10). He suggested committee members read this information before a provincial government representative speaks about ASIs at the next committee meeting. Following the presentation, members can decide how they want to pursue this.

Action item: before the next meeting, all committee members to review Dan Soprovich's handout "Protected Areas in the Tolko Forest Management License Area: 'Large Tracts of Forest Minimally Disturbed by Man'".

9. *Stumpage revenues staying in the north* - Sheldon McLeod asked if there was interest by any committee members in preparing a one-page backgrounder on this issue together with a suggestion on how the committee might proceed, and bringing this to the next meeting.

Action item: Ricky Pronteau to prepare this backgrounder.

10. *Forest conversion* - Sheldon McLeod asked if there was interest by any committee members in preparing a one-page backgrounder on this issue together with a suggestion on how the committee might proceed, and bringing this to the next meeting.

Action item: Glenn McIvor to prepare this backgrounder.

Joining the Tolko Manitoba FRAC and CSA Committees

Doug Hunt provided background on establishment of Tolko's original FRAC, and then on the CSA public advisory committee. He noted that as the CSA committee moves forward it will monitor progress of the SFM plan, at the same time as the FRAC continues to provide feedback on ongoing operations. The ground rules for both committees were handed out to committee members. Following discussion of the merits of combining the two committees, it was decided to pursue this.

Action item: Doug Hunt and Sheldon McLeod to bring draft ground rules for a combined committee to the next CSA public advisory committee meeting.

Tolko Manitoba Forest Management Web Site

Doug Hunt reported that Tolko Woodlands had launched its Web site, and provided a handout describing the site's content. The site URL is www.tolkomanitoba.com.

Next CSA Meeting and Closing Comments

Sheldon McLeod noted that completion of the draft SFM plan is about 2 months away. The next CSA public advisory committee has been tentatively set for March 24-25. Dates, times and location will be confirmed before the meeting.

The question of an aboriginal cultural awareness workshop was raised; this had been brought up during discussion of the SFM criterion relating to aboriginal values. Doug Hunt reported that Tolko was working on holding a 1-day workshop on this topic in April for committee members and Woodlands staff.

Criteria 3 Conservation of Soil and Water Resources

Element 3.2 Water Quality and Quantity

Conserve water resources to maintain water quality and quantity.

Value: Healthy watersheds.

Objective: Maintain the integrity of water quality and quantity as a result of woodlands operations.

<u>Indicator</u>	<u>Target</u>	<u>Acceptable Level</u>
Number of non-compliances adjacent to watercourses.	Zero non-compliances with Tolko SOPs and government work permit conditions.	
Condition of stream crossings and roadways.	Inspect (at least annually; after spring runoff) and act in a timely fashion appropriate to the magnitude of the problem and commensurate with the level of environmental impact.	

Criteria 3 Conservation of Soil and Water Resources

Element 3.2 Water Quality and Quantity

Conserve water resources to maintain water quality and quantity.

Value: Healthy watersheds.

Objective: Work towards an understanding of watershed health impacts/influences of forest operations.

Indicator	<u>Target</u>	Acceptable Level
Reporting on evolution of hydrological research specific to forestry.	Review and report annually.	

-